

**Naval Postgraduate School
School of International Graduate Studies
Department of National Security Affairs**

NS3155: INTELLIGENCE AND DEMOCRACY (4 - 0)

Spring Quarter 2002

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course examines the methods civilian authorities in emerging democracies can use to establish strong, effective controls over their intelligence agencies. The course begins by examining the intelligence process in the United States and the United Kingdom and the potential problems that intelligence activities can pose to democratic governance. Next, students will analyze the mechanisms used by the U.S., the U.K., France and other long-established democracies to maintain control over their intelligence organizations. These instruments of control include use of the power of the purse, structural and organizational arrangements, legislative oversight, and legal mechanisms. Employing the case study approach, students will examine the recent efforts by democracies in Latin America, Central Europe, Africa, and Asia to establish their own democratic controls over intelligence and the challenges that such nations will face in the future. PREREQUISITE: None. CLASSIFICATION: Unclassified.

INSTRUCTOR INFORMATION

Ken Dombroski
Lecturer, Center for Civil-Military Relations
kdombroski@nps.navy.mil

TEXTS

The following required texts are available for purchase at the NPS bookstore:

Mark M. Lowenthal, *Intelligence: From Secrets to Policy* (CQ Press, 2000)

Peter Gill, *Policing Politics: Security Intelligence and the Liberal Democratic State* (Cass, 1994)

Michael Herman, *Intelligence Power in Peace and War* (Cambridge, 1996)

Paul Wilkinson, *Terrorism Versus Democracy* (Cass, 2001)

The following optional text is available for purchase at the NPS bookstore:

Pat M. Holt, *Secret Intelligence and Public Policy: A Dilemma of Democracy* (CQ Press, 1995)

The following texts are on reserve in the NPS library:

Craig Eisendrath, ed., *National Insecurity: U.S. Intelligence After the Cold War* (Temple University Press, 2000)

Kieran Williams and Dennis Deletant, *Security Intelligence Services in New Democracies: The Czech Republic, Slovakia and Romania* (Palgrave, 2001)

The following articles are available in a course reader at the reserve desk in the NPS library:

Greta Marlatt, "Intelligence and Policy-Making: A Bibliography," Dudley Knox Library, NPS (Aug. 1998)

United States Central Intelligence Agency, *A Consumer's Guide to Intelligence* (CIA Office of Public Affairs, 1999)

Loch Johnson, "Analysis for a New Age," *Intelligence and National Security*, (Oct. 96), pp. 657-671

Loch Johnson, Ch. 4., "Seven Sins of Strategic Intelligence," *America's Secret Power: The CIA in a Democratic Society* (Oxford, 1989), pp. 59-75

Douglas Porch, "French Intelligence Culture: A Historical and Political Perspective," *Intelligence and National Security* (July 1993), pp. 486-511

Alfred Stepan, Ch. 2, "The Brazilian Intelligence System in Comparative Perspective," *Rethinking Military Politics* (Princeton, 1988), pp. 12-29

Priscila Antunes and Marco Cepik, "The New Brazilian Intelligence Law: An Institutional Assessment," unpublished paper (Oct. 2000)

Loch Johnson, "The CIA and the Question of Accountability," *Intelligence and National Security* (Jan. 1997), pp. 178-200

Stephen Knott, "Executive Power and the Control of American Intelligence," *Intelligence and National Security* (Summer 1998), pp. 171-176

Loch Johnson, "Intelligence and the Challenge of Collaborative Government," *Intelligence and National Security* (Summer 1998), pp. 177-182

Stansfield Turner, Appendix: "A Word on Censorship," *Secrecy and Democracy* (Houghton, 1985), pp. 287-290

Robert Henderson, "South African Intelligence Under de Klerk," *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence* (Spring 1995), pp. 51-89

Shawn McCarthy, "South Africa's Intelligence Reformation," *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence* (Spring 1996), pp. 63-71

Jonathan Moran, "The Role of the Security Services in Democratization: An Analysis of South Korea's Agency for National Security Planning," *Intelligence and National Security* (Winter 1998), pp. 1-32

The following articles are available on the Internet for download:

Thomas Bruneau, "Intelligence and Democratization: The Challenge of Control in New Democracies," Center for Civil-Military Relations Occasional Paper #5, (March 2000)
http://www.ccmr.org/public/images/download/new_democracies.pdf

- Frank, Watanabe, "Fifteen Axioms for Intelligence Analysts," *Studies in Intelligence* (no. 1, 1997) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/97unclass/axioms.html>
- Jack Davis, "A Policymaker's Perspective on Intelligence Analysis" *Studies in Intelligence* (vol. 38, no. 5, 1995) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/95unclass/Davis.html>
- Jack Davis, "Paul Wolfowitz on Intelligence Policy-Relations" *Studies in Intelligence* (vol. 39, no. 5, 1996) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/96unclass/davis.htm>
- Working Paper Series on Internal Security Reform, Project on Justice in Times of Transition, Harvard University <http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/justiceproject/workingpapers.htm>
- L. Britt Snider, *Sharing Secrets With Lawmakers: Congress as a User of Intelligence* (CIA, 1997) <http://www.cia.gov/csi/pubs.html>
- Frederic F. Manget, "Intelligence and the Rise of Judicial Intervention," *Studies in Intelligence* (no. 5, 1996) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/96unclass/manget.htm>
- Stanley Kober, "Why Spy? The Uses and Misuses of Intelligence," *Cato Policy Analysis* No. 265 (Dec. 12, 1996) <http://www.cato.org/pubs/pas/pa-265.html>
- Council on Foreign Relations, *Making Intelligence Smarter: The Future of U.S. Intelligence*, (1996) <http://www.fas.org/irp/cfr.html>

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

This course will be conducted as a colloquium. The instructor will introduce the topics through a lecture followed by student discussions of questions and issues raised during the lecture and the assigned readings. Students are expected to do all assigned readings and actively participate in class discussions. The instructor will assign periodic position papers based on weekly discussion questions. The take-home final exam will be based on the assigned readings and the weekly discussion questions. The standards used in grading papers and examinations are described in [The American Association of University Professors Statement on Professional Ethics](#) adopted as a policy document by the National Security Affairs Department.

COURSE SCHEDULE

Course Overview

- Week 1: Defining Intelligence**
 2 April Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 1, pp. 1-9
 Herman, Intro and Part I: Ch.1, pp. xi-15
- 4 April **Intelligence as an Issue for Democratic Governance**
Reading: Thomas Bruneau, "Intelligence and Democratization: The Challenge of Control in New Democracies," CCMR Occasional Paper #5 (March 2000)
http://www.ccmr.org/public/images/download/new_democracies.pdf
Recommended: Gill, Introduction and Ch. 1, pp. 1-47
 Holt, Ch. 1, pp. 2-19
- Week 2: State and Security Intelligence Models**
 9 April Reading: Gill, Ch. 2-3, pp. 48-134

11 April **Roles and Missions of Intelligence Agencies**
Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 2-4, pp. 10-52
Herman, Part I: Ch. 2-3, pp. 16-57
CIA, *A Consumer's Guide to Intelligence* (1999)
Recommended: Holt, Ch. 2-3, 20-53

The Intelligence Process

Week 3: The Intelligence Process – Collection

16 April Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 5, pp. 53-74
Gill, Ch. 4, pp. 135-178
Herman, Part II: Ch. 4-5, pp. 61-99
Recommended: Holt, Ch. 454-79
Eisendrath, Ch. 8, pp.149-171

18 April **The Intelligence Process – Analysis and Production**

Lowenthal, Ch. 6, pp. 75-97
Gill, Ch. 5, pp. 179-206
Herman, Part II: Ch. 6-7, pp. 100-133, Part V: Ch.16, pp. 283-304
Loch Johnson, “Analysis for a New Age,” *Intelligence and National Security*, (Oct. 1996), pp. 657-671
Frank, Watanabe, “Fifteen Axioms for Intelligence Analysts,” *Studies in Intelligence* (no. 1, 1997) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/97unclass/axioms.html>
Recommended: Holt, Ch. 5 pp. 80-108

Week 4: The Intelligence Process- Role of the Policy Maker

23 April Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 9, pp. 120-132
Herman, Part III: Ch. 8-9, pp. 137-164
Loch Johnson, Ch. 4., “Seven Sins of Strategic Intelligence,” *America's Secret Power: The CIA in a Democratic Society* (Oxford, 1989), pp. 59-75
Jack Davis, “A Policymaker's Perspective on Intelligence Analysis” *Studies in Intelligence* (vol. 38, no. 5, 1995)
<http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/95unclass/Davis.html>
Jack Davis, “Paul Wolfowitz on Intelligence Policy-Relations” *Studies in Intelligence* (vol. 39, no. 5, 1996)
<http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/96unclass/davis.htm>

25 April **The Intelligence Process – Counterintelligence and Covert Action**

Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 7-8, pp. 98-119
Herman, Part III: Ch. 10-12, pp. 165-218
Recommended: Holt, Ch. 6-7, pp. 109-167
Eisendrath, Ch. 2 and 5, pp. 23-44 and 76-91

Week 5: Problems in the Process - US and UK Perspectives

30 April Readings: Herman, Part IV, Ch. 13-15, pp. 221-279
Eisendrath, Ch. 4, pp. 61-75

2 May **Case Study: French Intelligence Culture** (Guest Lecturer)
Reading: Douglas Porch, "French Intelligence Culture: A Historical and Political Perspective," *Intelligence and National Security* (July 1993), pp. 486-511

Controlling Intelligence Activities in a Democracy

Week 6: Intelligence Structures and Democratic Control

7 May Readings: Herman, Part V: Ch.16-18, pp. 283-338
Gill, Ch. 6, pp. 207-247
Recommended: Elizabeth Rindskopf Parker, "The American Experience: One Model for Intelligence Oversight in a Democracy," Working Papers on Internal Security Reform <http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/justiceproject/workingpapers.htm>

9 May **Case Study: Structural Change in Brazil** (Guest Lecturer)
Readings: Alfred Stepan, *Rethinking Military Politics* (Princeton, 1988), Ch. 2, "The Brazilian Intelligence System in Comparative Perspective"
Priscila Antunes and Marco Cepik, "The New Brazilian Intelligence Law: An Institutional Assessment," unpublished paper, Oct. 2000

Week 7: Executive Oversight of Intelligence in Democracies

14 May Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 10, pp.133-135
Gill, Ch. 7, pp. 248-273
Holt, Ch. 9, pp. 189-208
Loch Johnson, "The CIA and the Question of Accountability," *Intelligence and National Security* (Jan. 1997), pp. 178-200.
Stephen Knott, "Executive Power and the Control of American Intelligence," *Intelligence and National Security* (Summer 1998), pp. 171-176
Loch Johnson, "Intelligence and the Challenge of Collaborative Government," *Intelligence and National Security* (Summer 1998), pp. 177-182

16 May **Legislative and Judicial Oversight of Intelligence in Democracies**

Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 10, pp. 136-154
Holt, Ch. 10, 209-236
Eisendrath, Ch. 9, pp. 172-189
Gill, Ch. 8, pp. 274-310
Philip Heyman, "Controlling Intelligence Agencies," Working Papers on Internal Security Reform <http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/justiceproject/workingpapers.htm>
L. Britt Snider, *Sharing Secrets With Lawmakers: Congress as a User of Intelligence* (CIA, 1997) <http://www.cia.gov/csi/pubs.html>
Frederic F. Manget, "Intelligence and the Rise of Judicial Intervention," *Studies in Intelligence* (no. 5, 1996) <http://www.odci.gov/csi/studies/96unclass/manget.htm>

Week 8: The Role of the Media and Public Awareness

21 May Readings: Holt, Ch. 8, 171-188
Eisendrath, Ch. 6, pp. 92-117

Stansfield Turner, *Secrecy and Democracy* (Houghton, 1985), Appendix: "A Word on Censorship," pp. 287-290

23 May

Case Study: Transforming Security Intelligence in South Africa

Readings: Robert Henderson, "South African Intelligence Under de Klerk," *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence* (Spring 1995)
Shawn McCarthy, "South Africa's Intelligence Reformation," *International Journal of Intelligence and Counterintelligence* (Spring 1996)
Sandy Africa and Siyabulea Mlombile, "Transforming the Intelligence Services: Some Reflections on the South African Experience," Working Papers on Internal Security Reform <http://www.ksg.harvard.edu/justiceproject/workingpapers.htm>

Intelligence Issues in Democracies

Week 9: Intelligence Agencies and Democratization

28 May

Readings: Gill, Ch. 9, pp. 311-351
Herman, Parts VI-VII, 341-385
Jonathan Moran, "The Role of the Security Services in Democratization: An Analysis of South Korea's Agency for National Security Planning," *Intelligence and National Security* (Winter 1998), pp. 1-32

30 May

Case Study: The Legacy of the Securitate in Romania

Readings: Williams and Deletant, Ch. 1 and 6-7, pp. 1-23 and 159-262

Week 10: Terrorism and the Threat to Democracies

4 June

Reading: Wilkinson, Ch. 1-3, pp. 1-77

6 June

Dealing With Terrorism in a Democracy

Reading: Wilkinson, Ch. 4-6 and 8, pp. 78-136 and 157-173

Week 11: Ethical and Moral Issues in Intelligence

11 June

Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 13, pp. 184-200
Stanley Kober, "Why Spy? The Uses and Misuses of Intelligence," *Cato Policy Analysis* No. 265 (Dec. 12, 1996) <http://www.cato.org/pubs/pas/pa-265.html>
Wilkinson, Ch. 7 and 9-10, pp. 137-156 and 174-202

13 June

Intelligence Challenges for the Future

Readings: Lowenthal, Ch. 12, pp. 167-183
Wilkinson, Ch. 11-12, pp. 203-234
Recommended: Eisendrath, Ch. 1, pp. 8-22
Council on Foreign Relations, *Making Intelligence Smarter: The Future of U.S. Intelligence*, (1996) <http://www.fas.org/irp/cfr.html>
Holt, 237-249

Week 12: Final Exam Due - 18 June